Judge's Commentary

KATÔ, Hiroko

Sketches of Various Birds after Kanô Tanyû by Noda Tômin as Related to Ogata Kôrin's Sketches of Birds and Animals

This article reflects truly fascinating research that offers a new perspective and methodology on the study of Edo period sketches from life, or shaseizu. Katô uses two works for her case study, namely Noda Tômin's Sketches of Various Birds and Ogata Kôrin's Sketches of Birds and Animals, both copies of the now-lost Kanô Tanyû Sketches of Birds, and further clarifies the relationship between the two works. The methods used in this comparison of these two copies, for whom there is no extant original, were both innovative and generative of new knowledge. Namely, she focused on the shared characteristics rather than differences in the format and depiction used in the two sets of sketches, and thus revealed that the two painters overcame simple school affiliation through sketching. She further discerned the detailed differences in the amount of information presented in images and coloring as her method of calculating the distance of each work from its original. These findings persuasively supported her new theory, overthrowing past theories, that Kôrin's sketches are in fact closer to the original Tanyû sketches than the Tômin sketches. Of particular note is her close examination of the details of the birds sketched in the works and actual birds of those types. She offered three points as the depictive characteristics seen in the two works, namely depiction of stereotyped eyes thanks to working from dead birds, stereotyped poses based on depictions seen in bird and flower paintings, and a tendency towards surface depiction. Further, through this analysis she arrived at the universal interpretation of the actual practice and meaning of "shaseizu" or sketches from life. We would like to highly praise the foresight seen in Katô's

article, the potential for research on copies without extant originals and the reconsideration of Edo period painting history in terms of *shaseizu*.

Katô's awareness of the issues involved, and the anticipation she creates for subjecting pre-modern Japanese painting history to a reconsideration based on a broader vantage point that surpasses the framework of school affiliation, makes this article fully worthy of the *Bijutsushi* Article Prize.